ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 2

CODED CHARACTER SETS

SECRETARIAT: JAPAN (JISC)

DOC TYPE: Disposition of Comments

TITLE: Disposition of comments Report on SC 2 N 3442, FCD 10646-2, Information technology -- Universal Multiple-Octet Coded Character Set (UCS) -- Part 2: Secondary Multilingual Plane for scripts and symbols, Supplementary Plane for CJK Ideographs, Special Purpose Plane [WG 2 N 2280]

SOURCE: ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 2/WG 2

PROJECT: JTC 1.02.18.02

STATUS: This document was approved at the 39th WG 2 meeting and endorsed by SC 2 at its tenth plenary meeting held in Athens, Greece, 2000-09-25/26. In accordance with Resolution M10.09 of the plenary meeting, the revised text will be submitted to ITTF for a FDIS letter ballot upon receipt from the project editor.

ACTION ID: FYI

DUE DATE:

DISTRIBUTION: P, O and L Members of ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 2
WG Conveners and Secretariats
Secretariat, ISO/IEC JTC 1
ISO/IEC ITTF

NO. OF PAGES: 21

ACCESS LEVEL: Defined

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC2/WG2
Coded Character Set
Secretariat: Japan (JISC)

Doc. Type: **Disposition of comments**

Title: **Disposition of comments on SC2 N 3442 (ISO/IEC FCD 10646-2)**

Source: **Michel Suignard (project editor)**
Project: JTC1 02.18.02
Status: For review by WG2
Date: 2000-09-22
Distribution: WG2
Reference: SC2 N3442, SC2 N3475/WG2 N 2276
Medium: Paper

Comments were received from Canada, China, Germany, Ireland, Japan, Korea (DPRK), Sweden and USA. The following document is the disposition of those comments. The disposition is organized per country.

As a result of this disposition, all countries that had voted negatively have reversed their votes to Yes.

Canada: comment:

Technical comment:
(Concerning the content of plane CJK Extension B)… The various script experts should review the final character sets, their glyphs and allocation and any errors found during the final review should be corrected in the FDIS text.

Accepted

IRG have done extensive review of the repertoire of Extension B through the different revisions (R1 and R2) and is committed to provide a final version by mid September 2000.

China: comment:

Technical comment:
China requests that the last version of CJK Unified Ideographs Extension B, which is provided by IRG (including HKSAR mapping information), should be adopted in DIS…

Accepted

IRG have done extensive review of the repertoire of Extension B through the different revisions (R1 and R2) and have provided a final version September 22nd 2000. That version will be included in the FDIS. It was agreed that the content of Extension B is frozen except for the following:
- Character glyph tuning
- Source information from DPRK.

These 2 items will be provided no later than December 8th (end of IRG meeting in Korea) for inclusion in the FDIS.

Etruscan
Major 1: Rename table to Old Italic: **Accepted**
Also asked by Ireland and the USA.

Major 2: Remove Old Italic numeral from One Hundred and up (10325 to 1326): **Accepted**
Ireland and the USA are asking for removal of 10326-10329, but not 10325: ETRUSCAN NUMERAL
ONE HUNDRED. It was agreed to remove 10325.

Major 3: Unification/removal of ETRUSCAN WORD SEPARATOR: **Accepted**
Ireland and the USA made a similar request.

Deseret
Remove the repertoire: **Not accepted**
Once again, Deseret qualifies as belonging to category 4 (historical languages of interest to religious and
scholarly communities).

Western Musical Symbols
Minor: add concrete examples for practical Musical encoding: **Accepted in principle**
A future amendment to Part 2 will either provide that information or more probably point to external
resources like a future version of the Unicode standard.

Mathematical Alphanumeric Symbols
Comment 1: correct mistakes in 1D42C-1D42F: **Accepted**
Also asked by the USA.

Comment 2: improve glyphs: **Accepted**
Also asked by the USA and Ireland.

Annex E
Minor: expand non-SPP: **Accepted**

Ireland: comments:

Technical comments:
Clause 4
T.4.1: use five of instead six digits notation scripts: **Accepted**
This notation went from 5 to 6 digit following an editor question in the CD that was only addressed by Germany. This time both Ireland and the USA have provided argument to go back to the 5-digit notation (five digit in common use and sufficient to cover part 2 repertoire).

T.4.2: Add a note about usage of 5-digit notation: **Accepted in principle**
Instead of adding a note, and as a consequence of the previous disposition (T.4.1), the third line of the 2nd paragraph can say three digits instead of two. The 4th line already mentions five-digit and is correct according to the new definition.

Clause 6
T.6.1: The SMP shall not be used (instead of 'is not used'): **Not accepted**
The text proposed by Ireland would put the sentence back to the CD text that was commented by the UK (2nd editorial comment. The usage of 'shall' is inappropriate in the current context.

T.6.2: Issue with the term 'reserved': **Accepted in principle**
Unlike what the Irish comment says, the term 'reserved is used in Part 1 (end of clause 8). Another solution is to simply add a note similar to the Note in clause 8 of Part 1:
Note: The code positions 1FFFE and 1FFFF can be used for internal processing uses requiring a numeric value that is guaranteed not to be a coded character.

Clause 7
T.7.1: same as T.6.1: **Comment withdrawn by Ireland**

Clause 8
T.8.1: same as T.6.1: **Comment withdrawn by Ireland**

T.8.2: Specification of Alternate Format Characters: **Accepted**
Clause 8 will say 'clause 20 of Part1' instead of 'Annex F of Part1'.

Clause 10 Etruscan
T.10-T1.1: replace Etruscan by Old Italic: **Accepted**
The proposed name is also requested by Germany and the USA (T.4) and corresponds better to their scope.

T.10.T1.2: change accordingly character names and block heading: **Accepted**

T.10-T1.3: remove character 10320 (Etruscan word separator): **Accepted**
The US (T.4) is also requesting the proposed removal. The character may be added later if further study shows its need.

T.10-T1.4: add 'OLD ITALIC CHARACTER TA (Messapic): **withdrawn by Ireland**
(It was agreed that the character needed further study before inclusion)

T.10-T1.5: remove characters 10326-10329 (numeric characters): **Accepted**
The US (T.4) is also requesting the proposed removal. The characters may be added later if further study shows their need.

T.10-T1.6: change names for 10302 (CE vs. KE) and 10312 (QO vs. of KU): **Not accepted**

Clause 10 Deseret
T.10-T3.1: remove extraneous space in the name of 10428 (small letter long i): **Accepted**

Clause 10 Byzantine musical symbols
T.10-T3.1: typo: is the same as previous T.10-T3.1: **Not applicable to this block**

T.10-T3.2: remove parenthesis around ICHOS in 1D0A9: **Accepted**

T.10-T3.3: remove parenthetical comments (u), (m), (l): **Accepted**
The US (T.6) is also requesting the proposed removal. As these levels are not agreed upon among experts it is preferable to remove them.

T.10-T3.4: consistent naming: **Accepted**
All names should follow the same convention; all names will have a 'BYZANTINE MUSICAL SYMBOL' prefix with some minor update to the names as a consequence of the suffix/prefix swap.

Clause 10 Western musical symbols
T.10-T7.1: remove 1D110-1D112: **Accepted**
The USA (T.7) is also requesting the proposed removal. This was an editor error when applying the WG2 resolution adding them to Part 2 (Resolution M34.14).

T.10-T7.2: remove 1D13E (Old style C Clef): **Accepted**
The USA (T.7) is also requesting the proposed removal.

T.10-T7.3: remove WESTERN from block name and all character names: **Accepted**
The USA (T.7) is also requesting the proposed removal.

T.10-T7.4: add MUSICAL SYMBOL END OF STIMME: **Accepted**
The USA (T.7) is also requesting the proposed addition.

T.10-T7.5: add MUSICAL SYMBOL FINGERED TREMOLO ONE and TWO: **Accepted**
The USA (T.7) is also requesting the proposed additions.

T.10-T7.6: rearrange the table in a more logic manner: **Accepted**
The USA (T.7) is also in favor of a reordering.

T.10-T7.7: rename characters according to list: **Accepted**
(Note that one character: FERMATA UNDER/BELOW is out of order in the change list, the changes are mostly the addition of 'COMBINING' to combining characters and replacing x-START and y-END by BEGIN x and END y). In addition, WG2 agreed to replace all references to numeral value by their digit, like 'TREMOLO ONE' becomes 'TREMOLO-1'.

Clause 10 Mathematical Alphanumeric symbols
T.10-T10.1: replace 'OPEN-FACE' by 'DOUBLE-STRUCK' in names: **Accepted**
The USA (T.8) is also requesting the proposed renaming.

T.10-T10.2: replace 'OPEN-FACE ITALIC' by 'BOLD FRAKTUR' in names and glyphs:
Accepted
The USA (T.8) is also requesting the proposed renaming and glyphs changes. The original submission was requesting the bold fraktur.

T.10-T11.1: replace 'OPEN-FACE' by 'DOUBLE-STRUCK' in names: **Accepted**
The USA (T.8) is also requesting the proposed renaming.

T.10-T11.2: replace 'SANS' by 'SANS-SERIF' in names: **Accepted**

T.10-T11.3 replace 'OPEN-FACE ITALIC' by 'BOLD FRAKTUR' in names and glyphs: **Accepted**

T.10-T12.1: replace 'SANS' by 'SANS-SERIF' in names: **Accepted**

T.10-T14.1: replace 'SANS' by 'SANS-SERIF' in names: **Accepted**

T.10-T15.1: replace 'SANS' by 'SANS-SERIF' in names: **Accepted**

Clause 11 Supplementary Plane for CJK Ideographs
T.11-2.1: change 'is not used' to 'does not apply': **Accepted**

Clause 12 Special Purpose Plane
T.12-1.1: fix Figure 3 title: **Accepted**

T.12-1.1: change the name of the SPP and its acronym: **Accepted**
This is requesting a name change for one of the plane. It is then a good idea to harmonize all the names and get a more rational set for all 3 planes. In consequence, 'Secondary' in SMP becomes 'Supplementary'. With the change for the SPP (Special Purpose Plane) to SSP (Supplementary Special-purpose Plane), all planes become 'Supplementary Planes' and the Part 2 title simply becomes 'Supplementary Planes'.

T.12-2.1: change text of clause 12.2: **Accepted**
The first sentence is not changed, but the next two proposed sentences are acceptable. In addition the text from the Japanese comment J-2 (CD ballot) should be added as well (was missed by the Editor for the FCD). The resulting text is acceptable by Ireland.

T.12-T-16.1: replace P=14 by P=0E: **Accepted**

Annex A: Collections
T.A1.1: Change 'Position' to 'Positions': **Accepted**

T.A1.2: Change 'Etruscan' to 'Old Italic': **Accepted**

T.A1.3: Use 5 digit notation: **Accepted**

T.A1.4: Expand CJK EXT-B': **Not applicable**
The note is not applicable anymore as the collection now only contains characters from plane 2. All collections that contain characters from the 2 parts must be specified in Part1.

T.A1.5: Remove 'EXTENDED' from the Alternate Format Character collection: **Accepted**

T.A1.6: Change the name of 'PART 2': **Accepted**

T.A2.1: Change 'from to' to 'Positions': **Accepted**

T.A2.2: Change 'Etruscan' to 'Old Italic': **Accepted**

T.A3.1: Change 'Block' to 'Blocks': **Accepted**

T.A3.2: Change 'from to' to 'Positions': **Accepted**

T.A4.1: Change 'blocks are' to 'block is': **Accepted**

T.A4.2: Change 'from to' to 'Positions': **Accepted**

Annex B: Combining characters
T.B.1: Add and remove characters as listed: **Accepted**
The US (T.14) is also requesting this.

Annex D: Name list
T.D.1-8: Update name list as a result of previous dispositions: **Accepted in principle**

Editorial comments:

Table of Contents
E.C.1: Change tab fill character: **Not accepted**
The table of content is automatically generated and corresponds to typography practice, even if it differs slightly from Part 1 (table of content manually generated).

E.C.2: Add a space before tab fill character: **Not accepted**
This is not a space character but a leading advance width necessary to keep the fill character in a singular horizontal phase in the whole page. Again this is typography practice.

E.C.3: Remove the line Annexes from TOC: **Not accepted**
The current layout is done to be similar to Part 1.

E.C.4: Remove the all caps on the Annexes lines: **Accepted**

E.C.5: Add 's' to Source: **Accepted**
This requires a change to the Annex title itself (self-generated).

Clause 1
E.1.1: Change start of 3rd paragraph: **Accepted in principle**
To be better balanced with the previous paragraph, the following sentence is suggested instead: 'ISO/IEC 10646 Part 2 specifies'.

E.1.2: Change '.' By ';' in 3rd list item: **Accepted**

E.1.3: Change 'repeated' by 'duplicated': **Accepted**

Clause 2
E.2.1: Rephrase conformance clause: **Accepted**

Clause 5
E.5.1: Rephrase Definitions introductory phrase: **Accepted**

Clause 6

E.6.1: Change last sentence as proposed: **Accepted in principle**
The following is proposed:
"The SMP contains coded graphic characters used in other scripts of the world that are not encoded or not already scheduled for encoding in the BMP. Most, but not all, of the scripts encoded or scheduled for encoding in the SMP are not in use as living scripts by modern user communities."

E.6.2: Remove 'miscellaneous' in front of 'syllabaries': **Accepted**

Clause 8
E.8.1: Change to 'Alternate Format Characters': **Accepted**

E.8.2: Change to 'ISO/IEC 10646-1': **Accepted**

Clause 9
E.9.1: Change to 'ISO/IEC 10646' and 'specify': **Accepted**

Clause 10
E.10.1: Change to NOTE –: **Accepted**

E.10.2: Change note as indicated: **Accepted in principle**
The comment is accepted as following:
"The Old Italic block represents a unified script that covers the Etruscan, Oscan, Umbrian, Faliscan, North Picene, and South Picene alphabets. Some of these alphabets can be written with characters oriented in either left-to-right or right-to-left direction. The glyphs in the code table are shown with left to right orientation."
(Messapic was removed from the alphabet list as noted by Ireland)

Another consequence of this disposition is the decision to add a new Annex in Part 2 describing mirroring characters in Part 2. All Old Italic characters are mirroring, even those that are symmetrical along their vertical axis in the current chart, as they glyphs may in fact be asymmetrical in other occurrences.

E.10.3: Change 'Etruscan' to 'Old Italic': **Accepted**

Clause 10 Etruscan
E.10.T1.1: Update charts as proposed: **Accepted**

E.10.T1.2: Turn the glyph for character 10322 (Numeral five): **Accepted**

Clause 10 Byzantine Musical Symbols
E.10.T5.1: Fix hex digit column after E5: **Accepted**
The FDIS will be published using a new charting process, similar to the Part 1 process.

E.10.T5.2: Update charts as proposed: **Accepted**

Clause 10 Western Musical Symbols
E.10.T6.1: Add dotted circles to combining characters, update glyphs: **Accepted**

E.10.T6.2: Add dashed boxes to NULL NOTEHEAD, BEGIN x and END y: **Accepted**

E.10.T6.3: Increase character size: **Accepted in principle**

Clause 10 Mathematical Alphanumeric Symbols

E.10.T10.1: Update charts as proposed: **Accepted**

E.10.T10.2: Replace open face by bold fraktur: **Not applicable**
The technical change is already covered by T.10.T0.2.

E.10.T11.1: Update charts as proposed: **Accepted**

E.10.T11.2: Replace open face by bold fraktur: **Not applicable**
The technical change is already covered by T.10.T11.2

E.10.T13.1 to E.10.T13-6: Update charts as proposed: **Accepted**

E.10.T14.1 to E.10.T14-8: Update charts as proposed: **Accepted**

E.10.T15.1 to E.10.T15-8: Update charts as proposed: **Accepted**

Clause 11 Supplementary Plane for CJK Ideographs

E.11.1: Removed unified in figure 2 title: **Accepted**

E.11.2.1: Change to 'The source reference': **Accepted**

E.11.2.2: Change to 'in the normative Annex C': **Accepted**

E.11.2.3: Remove 'that are' in g_KX and G_HZ descriptions: **Accepted**

E.11.2.4: Change to 'in addition to a 10-line header': **Accepted in principle**
The following new text replaces the description of Annex C:
"Annex C is a plain text file that specifies, after a 10-line header, as many lines as CJK Unified ideographs; each containing the following information organized in fixed width fields:"

E.11.2.5: Justify 'The format definition…': **Accepted**

E.11.2.6: Replace CJK parenthesis by round parenthesis: **Accepted**

E.11.3.1: Change to 'planes' in 1st sentence: **Accepted**

E.11.3.2: Capitalize 'Note': **Accepted**

Clause 12 Tags

E.12-T16.1: Update font: **Accepted**

Annex B

E.B.1: Change 'enumerated' to 'listed': **Accepted**

E.B.2: Change to 'level 2': **Accepted**

Annex D

E.D.1: Change to 'CJK Unified Ideographs': **Not accepted**
The text applies to both unified and compatibility CJK Ideographs.

E.D.2: Change paragraph formatting for 'Western Musical Symbol Flip to Longa': **Accepted**
The name list will become a plain text file linked directly from the main document.

Annex E

E.E1.1: In E.1 paragraph 1, change to 'these': **Accepted**

E.E1.2: In E.1 paragraph 2, change to 'These characters can be used': **Accepted**

E.E1.3: In E.1 paragraph 2, change 'ASCII-based' to 'ISO/IEC-646-based': **Not Accepted**
The committee felt that the current name is clear for a casual reader of what is an informative Annex.

E.E1.4: In E.1 paragraph 4, change to 'these issues in detail': **Accepted**

E.E1.5: In E.1 paragraph 5, change to 'contains': **Accepted**

E.E1.6: In E.1 paragraph 5, change to 'a language tag identification character': **Accepted**
To be consistent, 'tag cancel character' is also changed to 'cancel tag character'.

E.E1.7: In E.1 paragraph 6, remove last sentence: **Not accepted**
This text is a very useful reminder for future extension to the TAGS block.

E.E2.1: In E.2 paragraph 1, change 'ASCII-based' to 'ISO/IEC-646-based': **Not accepted**
See E.E1.3..

E.E2.2: In E.2 paragraph 1, remove 'instead': **Accepted**
This
 E.E2.3: In E.2 paragraph 1, remove last sentence: **Not accepted**
This is an informative annex which aims to be descriptive.

E.E2.4: In E.2 paragraph 3, remove 'only': **Accepted in principle**
The following change is proposed:
'Tag arguments can only be encoded using tag characters'.

E.E3.1: In E.3 paragraph 2, remove 'in any way': **Accepted**

E.E3.2: In E.3 paragraph 2, change to 'language-tagged: **Accepted**

E.E5.1: In E.5 use 5-digit notation: **Accepted**

E.E5.2: In E.5 change to 'corresponds to 2-letter code representing the Japanese language':
Accepted

Annex F

E.F.1: In the introduction, change 'made' to 'comprised': **Accepted**

E.F.2: In the introduction, change 'the following text' to 'this Annex': **Accepted**

E.F2.1: In F.2 paragraph 1, change to 'this international standard': **Accepted**

E.F2.2: In F.2 paragraph 1, change to 'this international standard': **Accepted**

E.F2.3: In F.2 paragraph 1, change to 'for general purposes in text descriptions of musical notation': **Accepted**

E.F2.4: In F.2 paragraph 2, change 'Extensive' to 'Extended': **Accepted**

E.F2.5: In F.2 paragraph 3, change the list format as requested: **Accepted**

E.F2.6: In F.2 paragraph 4, change to 'rendering ties, slurs, beams, and phrases as appropriate': **Accepted**

E.F2.7: In F.2 paragraph 5, change to 'values as well as primitives': **Accepted**

E.F2.8: In F.2 paragraph 5, change to 'are constructed': **Accepted**

E.F2.9: In F.2 paragraph 5, remove next to last sentence about data size: **Accepted**

E.F2.10: In F.2 paragraph 5, change to 'may wish to equivalence or normalize': **Not applicable**
The US comment T.16 asks for removal of that sentence because it would introduce an equivalence out of scope in this standard.

E.F2.11: In F.2 paragraph 5, add code positions in text: **Not applicable**
The US comment T.16 asks for removal of that sentence because it would introduce an equivalence out of scope in this standard.

E.F2.12: In F.2 paragraph 5, change 'pre-composed' to 'precomposed': **Not accepted**
Not in dictionary.

Annex G
E.G.1: Italicize as requested: **Accepted**

E.G.2: Change Etruscan to Old Italic: **Accepted**

E.G.3: Replace the Etruscan entry (now Old Italic): **Accepted**

As of this disposition of comment, Ireland changes its vote to Yes

Technical comments:
CJK Ideographs
J-1: CJK UNIFIED IDEOGRAPHS EXT B: update as per IRG 744 Revision: **Accepted**
This is also requested by Canada, China and the USA.

J-2: CJK COMPATIBILITY IDEOGRAPHS: format revision: **Accepted**
The FCD format was temporary, as the editor could not get in time a font to meet the deadline. Since then, a font is available and the content has been revised to take into account the latest version of Extension B.
The source information and the compatibility mapping will be provided in the FDIS in a format comparable to the similar information provided for Extension B source information.
It was also resolved to remove character 2F86D from the compatibility block. That character will belong to the CJK unified set as soon as the issue raised by TCA in document WG2 N 2269 is addressed by IRG. So it is unwise to add it to a compatibility set at this point.

Clause 1 Scope
J-3 a): Change the 1st sentence of 3rd paragraph: **Accepted in principle**
A similar change was asked by Ireland. See answer to E.1.1.

J-3 b): Change the 1st item of the list: **Not accepted**
It does not seem necessary to add the SPP to the list as by definition it does not contains characters belonging to scripts and symbols and that item only concerns scripts and symbols.

J-3 c): Delete Chinese/Japanese/Korean: **Accepted**
The extension was provided once in a way similar to Part-1 in clause 6.4, but it does not have to be here.

Clause 9 Special characters
J-4: Replace 'discuss' by a more appropriate term: **Accepted**
The sentence is now a Note as it refers to informative annexes and it reads as follows:
"NOTE - Annex E describes the usage of the Tag characters. Annex F describes the usage of the Musical special characters."

Clause 11.2 CJK Unified Ideographs
J-5 a): Replace 'described' by 'specified': **Accepted**
J-5 b): Add 'level-3' and 'level-4' to J3 and J4 entries: **Accepted**

Annex C
J-6: Source data provided as part of the standard: **Accepted in principle**
Providing the source information as printed form is not very useful but will be possible. A large majority of applications will benefit greatly from the information. The editor prefers greatly a solution that recognizes the fact 10646 is only available on a Compact Disk media. Users are typically going to print the textual part and exploit the rest through database tools. It is only necessary to ensure that all components of 10646-2 reside on the same media.

J-7: DPRK source information: **Accepted in principle**
This is related to production deadline for the FDIS, knowing that no technical revision is possible after the FDIS is issued, and that this request should not delay the issuance of the FDIS. It was agreed that, given that the rest of the source information is frozen immediately, the DPRK source information could be added at the end of the next IRG meeting, if IRG members agree with the source information.
It was also agreed to change the Korean (ROK) source information index prefix from 'K' to 'K4'.

As of this disposition of comments, Japan changes its vote to Yes

<u>Korea (DPRK): comments:</u>

Technical comments:

CJK Unified Ideographs
Provide source information for KPS Source: **Accepted in principle**
IRG has been providing that source information for all other source of CJK Unified Ideographs. It is up to IRG to provide this information to the editor in a schedule compatible with FDIS production schedule. See disposition of comment J-7 (Japan).

<u>As of this disposition of comments, Korea (DPRK) changes its vote to Yes</u>

Technical comments:

General
SE-1 General: Remove part of the SMP and the whole SPP: **Not accepted**
The rationale for inclusion has been already mentioned in the CD disposition of comments. A large majority of member bodies want them.

SE-2 Rename the subtitle to "Supplementary Planes": **Accepted**
The answer to the Irish comment T.12-1.1 by suggesting transforming all first 'S' of the plane acronyms to 'Supplementary' now allows this.

Clause 4 and 5
SE-3 a) Swap clause 4 and 5: **Accepted**

SE-3 b) Definitions do not define terms: **Partially accepted**
The plane definitions are similar to the BMP definition in Part 1.

SE-4 a) Definitions of U+ for 5 or 6 digit notation: **Not applicable**
These notations cover more than Part 2 and belong to the architectural part of Part 1.

SE-4 b) Use 5 digit notation when appropriate: **Accepted**

Clause 10 Etruscan
SE-5) Clarify Etruscan numeral: **Accepted in principle**
The characters are being removed as a consequence of other comments.

Clause 10 Byzantine Musical Symbols
SE-6) Annex F, clarify Byzantine musical symbols stripes: **Accepted in principle**
Given the conflicting information concerning these symbols, the description of these stripes will be significantly reduced in the FDIS text. These characters are not combining in the sense of a base character followed by combining mark(s).

Clause 10 Western Musical Symbols
SE-7) Western Musical Symbols, add combining in relevant names: **Accepted**

SE-8) Western Musical Symbols, remove 1D100-1D102, 1D19F and 1D1A0: **Partially accepted**
1D100-1D102 were encoded in error. For the two last characters, the similar characters in the BMP are ornamentation dingbats and cannot be used within the context of musical notation.

Clause 10 Mathematical alphanumeric Symbols
SE-9) Mathematical alphanumerical Symbols, remove them: **Not accepted**
See comment to the General comment.

Clause 11
SE-10) The CJK Ideographs names should use 5 hex digits instead of 8: **Accepted**

Clause 12 and Annex E
SE-11) Remove them: **Not accepted**
The rationale for inclusion has been already mentioned in the CD disposition of comments. A large majority of member bodies want them.

Annex C
SE-12) Change the CJK source reference format: **Partially accepted**
This is part of a more generic discussion about the distribution media of this standard. Printing this part is not the main usage of that part of the standard; it is really intended to be used as a reference by applications. See disposition of comment J-6 (Japan).

Editorial comments:

General, Intro
SE-ed 1: Fix Paginations: **Accepted**
The pagination will be consecutive in the FDIS.

SE-ed 2: Improve Part 2 title: **Accepted**

SE-ed 3: Foreword, update to include proposed text: **Accepted**

SE-ed 4: Consistently refer to 'part 1', rather the current mixture: **Accepted in principle**
The editor will ensure that references to Part are more consistent. There are however a trend through the comments to use expanded reference like 'ISO/IEC 10646-1'. Part 1 is used occasionally to make sentences less verbose.

SE-ed 5: Remove 'contents' from Page 1: **Accepted**

Clause 3
SE-ed 6: Update text following Part 1 template: **Accepted**

Clause 4
SE-ed 7: Swap clause 4 and 5: **Accepted**

Clause 5 Definition
SE-ed 8: Rename to 'Definition of Terms': **Not accepted**
This contradicts Part 1 usage, but will ITTF most recent guideline on this point if they have changed. However the first definition 'Part 1' was moved up to clause 3.

SE-ed 9: Remove definition numbering: **Not accepted**
This contradicts Part 1 usage.

Clause 4 Coding of characters
SE-ed 10: Rename clause to 'Naming of code positions': **Not accepted**

SE-ed 11: Fix the digit notation: **Accepted**
Fixed by going back to the 5 digits notation. (The confusion was created by an incomplete conversion from a five to six digit notation.)

SE-ed 12: Remove UTF-16 and UTF-8 summary: **Accepted in principle**
These text sections only described these transformation formats in relation to Part 2. The part described the numeral values in UTF16 term becomes a note.

General
SE-ed 13 a): Merge Clause 6, 10, 9 and Annex B: **Partially Accepted**

Clause 9 and annex B can contain characters from the three planes so they cannot be merged with other clauses that are specific to a given plane. However clauses 6 and 10 are being merged as well as clauses 7 and 11 and clauses 8 and 12. This makes possible to put all charts together in Part 2.

SE-ed 13 b): Merge Clause 8 and 12: **Accepted**
See SE-ed 13 a). In the same direction clause 7 and 11 would be merged.

Clause 6
SE-ed 14: Change the 2nd sentence as commented: **Accepted**
(The same changes are also applied to clause 7 and 8).

SE-ed 15: Change 'reserved for CJK' to 'reserved for additional CJK': **Accepted**

SE-ed 16: Change to 'the SMP is not used to encode any CJK': **Accepted in principle**
The accommodation of Irish comment T.6.1 already solves partially this comment.

SE-ed 17: Change to 'The SMP is scheduled to contain coded…': **Accepted**

Clause 7 or 8?
SE-ed 18: Change to 'Plane1' to 'Plane 1': **Accepted in principle**
It should probably read 'Part 1' for Clause 8, which is already addressed by Irish comment E.8.1.

Clause 8
SE-ed 19: Fix EF0FF: **Accepted in principle**
Covered by US Comment T.3, which ask the change to 'E0FFF'.

SE-ed 20: Fix inconsistency for 'Alternate Format Characters': **Accepted in principle**
Also covered by Irish comments T.8.2 and E.8.1. The distinction was not intended.

Clause 10
SE-ed 21: Change 'Code' by 'code' in clause title: **Accepted**

SE-ed 22: 4 digit chart columns and 5 digit hex columns: **Accepted**

Clause 10, (and 11, 12)
SE-ed 23: Issue with multicolumn layout: **Accepted**

SE-ed 24: Glyph issues: **Accepted in principle**
Fixed by new font and re-ordering of the characters.

SE-ed 25: Change 'code tables' by 'code tables and character names' in clause title: **Accepted**

Clause 11
SE-ed 26: Move Annex C description to Annex C: **Accepted**

SE-ed 27: 4 digit chart columns: **Accepted**
The editor will work with the IRG editor.

SE-ed 28: 4 digit chart columns: **Accepted**
The editor will work with the IRG editor.

Clause 12

SE-ed 29: comment about note: **Accepted in principle**
This note gives the unusual but very useful hints about unassigned characters. This text is seen as very important by some member body (like the US).

SE-ed 30: replace '…do not have printable graphic character…': **Accepted**
Replace 'character' by 'symbol'.

Table Headings (in ext B)
SE-ed 31: Replace ' :' by ': ', add 'Table nn – ': **Accepted**
The editor will work with the IRG editor.

<u>As of this disposition of comments, Sweden changes its vote to Yes</u>

Technical comments:

Clause 4
T-1: Use 5 digit notation: **Accepted**

Clause 6 SMP
T-2: In note change to 'Non CJK Ideographic scripts': **Accepted**

Clause 8 SPP
T-3: Change '0EF0FF' to 'E0FFF': **Accepted**

Clause 10 SMP
T-4: Etruscan, change 'Etruscan' to 'Old Italic', note changes, character removal: **Accepted**

T-5: Deseret, remove extra space in 'DESERET SMALL LETTER LONG I': **Accepted**

T-6: Byzantine musical symbols, remove 'Greek' from all names, use 'MUSICAL SYMBOL', remove 'uml ' notation: **Accepted**

T-7: Western musical symbols, remove 'Western, remove 1D100-1D102 and 1D13E, add some: **Accepted**
Same request from Ireland.

T-8: Mathematical alphanumeric symbols:,Replace 'Open Face Italic' by 'Bold Fraktur', 'Open Face' by 'Double struck', font reviews: **Accepted**
The names and glyphs have been changed.

Clause 11 CJK
T-9: Errors for 29C1C and 29D52, charts to be revised as latest IRG version: **Accepted in principle**

T-10: TCA compatibility, holes, missing characters: **Accepted**
(The editor has received updated font and source information from TCA.)

Clause 12 SPP
T-11: Fix Figure 3 title, add J-2 comment from CD ballot, change to 'Annex E': **Accepted**

Annex A
T-12: A.2, change collection names and remove the note: **Accepted**

T-13: A.3, change '020100' to '20000', '02FA1F' to '2FA0F': **Accepted partially**
'20000' is correct, but the new TCA contribution requires staying at '2FA1F'.

Annex B
T-14: In B.1 update combining list as requested: **Accepted**
Also requested by Ireland.

Annex F

T-15: In F.1 remove references to 'u,m,l' notation: **Accepted**

T-16: In F.2 remove text as requested: **Accepted**

Editorial comments:

Clause 10, 11 and 12
E-1: Reorganize the clauses to make the charts consecutive, new chart format: **Accepted**

Annex A
E-2: Change 'from to' to 'positions': **Accepted**

Annex C and D
E-3: Make Annex D (character names) a plain text file: **Accepted**

[end]