

Comments on Appendix A Part One
Possible Unification Examples (Revised April 2008)

Point 1 on a Possible Glyph Error

052	魚(09B5A) 臭(29D4B)		Flag 149 cognate. NB 魴 U+29D53 vs 魴 TD-3467 and 漁 U+6F01 vs 漁 TD-347E
-----	----------------------	--	--

The glyph of TD-347E should be different from that of U+6F01. The glyph shown above is possibly an error.

-END-

Comments on Appendix A Part Two
Possible Unification Examples (Revised April 2008)

Point 1 on the ‘市市’ Pair

099	市市	source glyph variants of 市 (05E02)	modified Flag 109
-----	----	---------------------------------------	----------------------

The description of ‘source glyph variants’ does not present the whole picture.

The KX index of ‘市’ (U+5E02) is 328.030, while that of ‘市’ (U+5DFF) is 328.010. ‘市’ and ‘市’ have different readings and meanings. They are separately encoded because they are non-cognate.

It follows that the two are not purely glyph variants.

Point 2 on a Glyph Error

127	𠂇𠂇	variants of 𠂇 (04EA7)	Flag 72
-----	----	-----------------------	---------

A glyph error is found. ‘𠂇’, is U+4E25. It should be replaced by ‘𠂇’, (U+4EA7).

-END-

Comments on Appendix B
Dis-unification Examples (Revised April 2008)

Point 1 on the Applicability of S.1.4.1

S.1.4.1 Different number of components

The examples below illustrate rule a) since the two ideographs in each pair have different numbers of components.

崖·厓, 肱·宏, 降·夆

S.1.4.1, with focus on the number of components, implies that there should be some ‘common’ components (i.e. structural similarity) in the pairs or triplets of glyphs under comparison.

For example, we will not use S.1.4.1 to explain the following pair:

‘二’ (two components) and ‘𠄎’ (three components)

The number of components is different but since there are no common components in these two glyphs, S.1.4.1 is not applicable.

For this reason, the following examples require further discussion:

141	備备	S.1.4.1	
170	盡尽	S.1.4.1	
180	靈灵	S.1.4.1	
187	買买	S.1.4.1	

208	萬万	S.1.4.1	
-----	----	---------	--

211	無无	S.1.4.1	
-----	----	---------	--

235	芻刍	S.1.4.1	
-----	----	---------	--

247	龍龙	S.1.4.1	
-----	----	---------	--

255	農农	S.1.4.1	
-----	----	---------	--

Take ‘

187	買买	S.1.4.1	
-----	----	---------	--

’,

as an example. The traditional form ‘買’ has two components (‘𠬞’, and ‘貝’). The simplified form ‘买’ also has two components (‘丩’, and ‘头’). The number of components is the same so S.1.4.1 does not apply.

[NB ‘

252	賣卖	S.1.4.3	
-----	----	---------	--

’,]

Point 2 on the Applicability of S.1.4.1 in addition to S.1.4.3

S.1.4.1 may apply to the following examples (in addition to S.1.4.3):

183	虜 虜	S.1.4.3	
184	鹵 鹵	S.1.4.3	

186	慮 慮	S.1.4.3	
-----	-----	---------	--

192	寧 宁	S.1.4.3	
-----	-----	---------	--

202	時 时	S.1.4.3	
-----	-----	---------	--

218	厭 厌	S.1.4.3	
-----	-----	---------	--

224	與 与	S.1.4.3	
-----	-----	---------	--

Point 3 on the Applicability of S.1.4.3 in place of S.1.4.1

S.1.4.3 may apply to the following examples (replacing S.1.4.1):

228	質 质	S.1.4.1	
-----	-----	---------	--

235	芻 刍	S.1.4.1	
-----	-----	---------	--

237	當 当	S.1.4.1	
-----	-----	---------	--

289	當 当	1.4.3	
-----	-----	-------	--

(cf _____ in

Appendix E)

239	發发	S.1.4.1	
-----	----	---------	--

242	會会	S.1.4.1	
-----	----	---------	--

(cf

290	會 会	1.4.3	
-----	-----	-------	--

 in Appendix E)

257	僉僉	S.1.4.1	
-----	----	---------	--

(cf

291	僉 僉	1.4.3	
-----	-----	-------	--

 in Appendix E)

258	喬乔	S.1.4.1	
-----	----	---------	--

(cf

292	喬 乔	1.4.3	
-----	-----	-------	--

 in Appendix E)

260	壽寿	S.1.4.1	
-----	----	---------	--

(cf

293	禱 寿	1.4.3	
-----	-----	-------	--

 in Appendix E)

Point 4 on the Applicability of S.1.4.3

S.1.4.3 Different structure of a corresponding component

The examples below illustrate rule c). The structure of one (or more) corresponding components within the two ideographs in each pair is different.

扌·擴, 策·筭, 艸·然, 聖·翌,
僉·僉, 區·區, 夾·夾, 單·單,
隹·隹, 戈·戈, 贊·贊, 襄·襄,
隹·隹, 間·間, 朶·朶, 雋·雋,
恒·恆, 奂·奂, 人·人, 呆·呆,
又·又

A key element in S.1.4.3 is ‘*corresponding*’ component. The pre-supposition here is that there should be some ‘common’ components (i.e. structural similarity) in the pairs or triplets of glyphs under comparison.

The application of S.1.4.3 to the following examples requires further consideration:

243	幾几	S.1.4.3	
-----	----	---------	--

Structurally speaking, ‘幾’ and ‘几’ have nothing in common.

Similarly, there are no ‘*corresponding*’ components in ‘義’ and ‘义’ in example 265

265	義义	S.1.4.3	
-----	----	---------	--

Based on the reasoning explained above, examples 271 and 280 may also be re-considered.

271	專专	S.1.4.3	
280	繇亦	S.1.4.3	

-END-

Comments on Appendix E Further Examples

Point 1 on the Applicability of S.1.4.1

Example Number	Pair	Reason	Notes
286	尋 寻	1.4.3	

S.1.4.1 is also a reason. In the following example:

287	産 产	1.4.3	
-----	-----	-------	--

the reason should be S.1.4.1 only.

Point 2 on the Choice of Example Glyphs

293	禱 寿	1.4.3	
-----	-----	-------	--

The pair of example glyphs should be changed to either

‘禱 禱’ or ‘壽 寿’.

Point 3 on the ‘𠄎𠄎𠄎’, Pair

Examples 297 and 298

297	品 (054C1) 品 (20BEE)		
298	單 (209A4) 單 (055AE)		

should be considered in conjunction with example 307

307	𠄎𠄎𠄎	cf U+5405 vs G_zyf00706. These are non-cognate. Do they have different abstract shapes?	
-----	-----	---	--

Point 4 on an Editorial Omission

301	畫 (07575) 畫 (0756B)	source separation rule	cf U+236DB and
-----	------------------------	------------------------------	----------------

Something is missing after ‘and’ in ‘cf U+236DB and’.

Point 5 on the ‘𠄎𠄎𠄎’, Pair

307	𠄎𠄎𠄎	cf U+5405 vs G_zyf00706. These are non-cognate. Do they have different abstract shapes?	
-----	-----	---	--

The two glyphs should have different abstract shapes.

297	品 (054C1) 品 (20BEE)		
298	單 (209A4) 單 (055AE)		

(cf)

Point 6 on Changing a Triplet to a Pair

310	兔兔兂	cf U+4FDB 俛 (𠄎𠄎𠄎 兔) vs compatibility U+2F806 (𠄎𠄎𠄎 兂), etc.	
-----	-----	--	--

‘兔’ and ‘兂’ are non-cognate. They have different actual shapes and abstract shapes.

For this reason, ‘兔’ should be deleted from the glyph set and example

310 should only contain the pair of ‘兂兂’, only.

Point 7

275	戩只	S.1.4.1
-----	----	---------

Neither S.1.4.1 nor S.1.4.3 is applicable in the absence of any common or corresponding components in ‘戩’ and ‘只’.

Example 275 may be deleted.

-END-