

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC2/WG2  
Coded Character Set  
Secretariat: Japan (JISC)

**Doc. Type:** Disposition of comments

**Title:** Disposition of comments on ISO/IEC DIS 10646 6<sup>th</sup> edition

**Source:** Michel Suignard (project editor)

**Project:** JTC1.02.10646.00.00.00.06

**Status:** For review by WG2

**Date:** 2020-06-17

**Distribution:** WG2

**Reference:** SC2 N4714

**Medium:** Paper, PDF file

Comments were received from Czech Republic, Japan, United States, and ISO publishing team. The following document is the disposition of those comments. The disposition is organized per country/entity (USA, Japan, Czech Republic, and ISO) in the following pages.

There were no disapproval votes.


A vast majority of the technical and editorial comments were accommodated. This results in some changes in the textual part of the standard, but no change in the repertoire (either code points or character names) as compared to the DIS content.

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: June 17, 2020

Document: DIS 10646 Comments

Project: 10646.00.00.00.06

MB/NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
US		34.5	Tagalog	te	The Tagalog block has a new font, so the block should be highlighted in blue.	Highlight the Tagalog block in blue.	Not accepted, 10646 editions do not highlight change or addition (unlike amendment)
US		34.5	Mongolian	te	The glyphs for the Mongolian characters U+1834, U+1871, and U+1878 were modified, so they should be highlighted in blue.	Highlight the glyphs for U+1834, U+1871, and U+1878 in blue.	Not accepted, 10646 editions do not highlight change or addition (unlike amendment)
US		34.5	Sundanese	te	The glyph for U+1BAB should have a dotted circle and be highlighted (as below). 	Modify the glyph as described.	Partially accepted, glyph changed but not highlighted
US		34.5	Miscellaneous Symbols and Pictographs	te	U+1F3B1 BILLIARDS is missing a glyph in both the chart (page 1616) and the names list (page 1621).	Insert the missing glyph.	Accepted
US		34.5		ed	Add the following code points to the list on pages 58-59 of characters whose appearance has changed from the previous edition: U+1700..U+170C, U+170E..U+1714, U+1834, U+1871, U+1878, and U+1BAB.	Add the code points to the list in section 34.5 (pages 58-59).	Not accepted, 10646 editions do not highlight change or addition (unlike amendment)
CZ	pp. 374	2E51		te	2E50 'cross patty with right crossbar' cross references 2720 'maltese cross', shouldn't 2E51 'cross patty with left crossbar' reference it too?	add cross reference between 2720 and 2E51	Editorial comment, Not needed, too close to existing xref
CZ	pp. 373	2E50		te	consider cross referencing 2E50 'cross patty with right crossbar' and 2C75 'latin capital letter half f' due to their similarities	add cross reference between 2C75 and 2E50	Editorial comment Accepted
CZ	pp. 374	2E51		te	consider cross referencing 2E51 'cross patty with left crossbar' and A7F5 'latin capital letter reversed half h' due to their similarities	add cross reference between 2E51 and A7F5	Editorial comment Accepted
CZ	pp. 1093	A7F6		te	consider cross referencing AF74 'latin small letter reversed half h' and 2C76 'latin small letter half h'	add cross reference between AF75 and 2C76	Editorial comment Not needed, too close to

<sup>1</sup> **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

<sup>2</sup> **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: June 17, 2020

Document: DIS 10646 Comments

Project: 10646.00.00.00.06

MB/ NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					for consistency with A7F5		existing xref
JP1		Page 15 Sub-clause 7.6		te	<p>Note says</p> <p>“UCS Sequences Identifiers cannot be used for specification of subset content. They may be used outside this standard to identify: composite sequences for mapping purposes, font repertoire, etc.”</p> <p>According to ISO/IEC Directives Part 2 (Eighth edition, 2018), 24.5 Specific principles and rules,</p> <p>Notes shall not contain requirements (e.g. use of “shall”) or any information considered indispensable for the use of the document, for example instructions (imperative mood), recommendations (e.g. use of “should”) or permission (e.g. use of “may”). Notes should be written as a statement of fact.</p>	Please move this description out from Notes and put into the body text.	Accepted
JP2		Page 27 Clause 19		te	<p>Same as above comment.</p> <p>See the following Notes.</p> <p>“NOTE 2 – For this reason, compatibility ideographs should only be used for maintaining and guaranteeing a round trip conversion with the specific national, regional, or other standard. Other usage is strongly discouraged.”</p> <p>“NOTE 3 – Because compatibility ideographs are not preserved through any normalization forms, use of standardized variation sequences for CJK Unified ideographs (see 17.6) may be preferred in contexts where normalization forms are used and the distinction between CJK Compatibility ideographs and the corresponding CJK Unified ideographs needs to be maintained. In context where compatibility ideographs should be preserved, normalization forms cannot be used.”</p>	Please move them out from Notes and put into the body text.	Accepted

<sup>1</sup> **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

<sup>2</sup> **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: June 17, 2020

Document: DIS 10646 Comments

Project: 10646.00.00.00.06

MB/ NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
JP3		Page 28 Sub-clause 21.1		te	Same as above comment. See the following Note. “NOTE – Indic combining marks for vowels form a special category of combining characters, since the presentation can depend on more than one of the surrounding characters. Thus it might not be desirable to associate these Indic combining marks with the character NO-BREAK SPACE.”	Please move this description out from Notes and put into the body text.	Accepted
JP4		Page 30 Clause 23.1		te	Same as above comment. See the following Note. NOTE 2 – When a combining character such as HANGUL SINGLE DOT TONE MARK (302E) is intended to apply to a sequence of Hangul Jamo it should be placed at the end of the sequence, after the Hangul Jamo character which completes the syllable block.	Please move this description out from Notes and put into the body text.	Accepted
JP5		Page 44 Clause 27.3		te	Same as above comment. See the following Note. NOTE – This does not preclude the informative use of name aliases or acronyms for the sake of clarity. However, the normative entity name will be unique. These informative aliases should not be confused with character name aliases which share the same name space as character names and are normative.	Please move this description out from Notes and put into the body text.	Accepted
JP6		Page 55 Clause 33		te	Same as above comment. See the following Note. “NOTE – Unassigned code points in this range should be ignored in normal processing and display.”	Please move this description out from Notes and put into the body text.	Accepted
JP7		Page 22		ed	“figures 7 to 12” in the following description is wrong.	Please change “figures 7 to 12” to “figures 8 to 14.”	Accepted

<sup>1</sup> **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

<sup>2</sup> **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: June 17, 2020

Document: DIS 10646 Comments

Project: 10646.00.00.00.06

MB/ NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
		Clause 14			Therefore, in using this coded character set, the reader is advised to refer first to the block names list in Annex A.2 or an overview of the Planes in figures 7 to 12, ...		
JP8		Page 22 Clause 15.1		ed	Same as above.  The blocks specified within the BMP, SMP, SIP and SSP are listed in A.2, and are illustrated in figures 7 to 12.	Please change "figures 7 to 12" to "figures 8 to 14."	Accepted
JP9		Page 31 Clause 23.2		ed	"1025 MYANMAR LETTER UU" in the following is wrong. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Independent vowel 1025 MYANMAR LETTER UU,</li> </ul>	Please change it to either of <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Independent vowel 1025 MYANMAR LETTER U,</li> </ul> or <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Independent vowel 1026 MYANMAR LETTER UU,</li> </ul>	Accepted  Change is: Independent vowel 1026 MYANMAR LETTER UU
JP1 0		Page 2748 Annex A.1		ed	"Note 3" in the following description is wrong.  400 (This collection number shall not be used, see Note 3.)  ...  500 (This collection number shall not be used, see Note 3.)	Please change "Note 3" to "Note 2."	Accepted
JP1 1		Page 2752 Annex A.2.2		ed	"11B90-11BEF" in the following is wrong.  NANDINAGARI 11B90-11BEF	Please change as the following and move after "DIVES AKURU 11900-1195F."  NANDINAGARI 119A0-119FF	Accepted
JP1 2		Page 2752 Annex A.2.2		ed	"1B170-1B28F" in the following is wrong.  NUSHU 1B170-1B28F	Please change as the following.  NUSHU 1B170-1B2FF	Accepted
JP1 3		Page 2813 Annex N.2		ed	"Annex B" in the following description is wrong.  "ISO/IEC 8824-1 Annex B specifies the form of object identifier values for objects that are specified in an ISO standard."	Please change "Annex B" to "Annex D."	Accepted

<sup>1</sup> **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

<sup>2</sup> **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: June 17, 2020

Document: DIS 10646 Comments

Project: 10646.00.00.00.06

MB/NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
JP1 4		Page 9 Clause 5		ge	At the 3rd CD ballot, Japan NB commented about the URL links to the reference documents. We confirmed that they are correctly changed to <a href="http://standards.iso.org/iso-iec/10646/ed-6/.....">http://standards.iso.org/iso-iec/10646/ed-6/.....</a> in DIS. We appreciated your effort.		Noted
**		ALL		Ed	ISOCS has not provided an edited, tracked changes (watermarked) Word file for this document. The comments provided summarize the editorial changes required before next submission.	For questions about the drafting rules, contact Katherine Bennett: <a href="mailto:bennett@iso.org">bennett@iso.org</a>	Noted
**		ALL		Ed	For all references in the text to content on ISO's URN site, the link shall contain '/en' as part of the link given.	Insert 'en' into all links, for example: <a href="https://standards.iso.org/iso-iec/10646/ed-6/en/CJKSrc.txt">https://standards.iso.org/iso-iec/10646/ed-6/en/CJKSrc.txt</a>	Accepted
**		ALL		Ed	ISOCS will add a running header to the PDF for FDIS/PRF stage and publication.  The running footer for copyright should not be in bold font.	Please remove running header ('ISO/IEC 10646:2020 (E) Draft International Standard (DIS)') from submission file.  Please change running footer ('© ISO/IEC – All rights reserved') to non-bold style.	Accepted
**		Foreword		Ed	The ISO/IEC Foreword has been slightly modified since the 5th Edition was published.  According to the ISO database, ISO/IEC 10646:2017/Amd 1 was published in 2019, not 2018.	Please check the simple template (available at <a href="https://www.iso.org/drafting-standards.html">https://www.iso.org/drafting-standards.html</a> ) to update the Foreword fixed text.  Correct date of Amd 1 in paragraph 7.	Accepted
**		Table of contents		Ed	The ToC is not hyperlinked and the submission PDF is not bookmarked, so navigation of the document is difficult for the user.	Provide functioning navigation in ToC or bookmarks in PDF for next submission.	Accepted in principle, the standard is produced merging 2 very different contents (text and code chart) and this presents specific challenges on these matters.
**		Introduction		Ed	Paragraph 1 duplicates paragraph 1 of the Scope.	Delete paragraph 1 of Introduction.	Accepted
**		Foreword, 1,		Ed	For all bulleted lists, an em dash (—) should be	Replace all round bullets with an em dash.	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: June 17, 2020

Document: DIS 10646 Comments

Project: 10646.00.00.00.06

MB/ NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
		6, 10.2, 17.6.2, 17.6.3, 23.2, 23.4, 24.1, 24.2, 25.2, 26.2, 27.1, 27.2, 28, 34.3, 34.4, A.4.5, A.4.6, A.5.6, A.5.11, F.1.1, F.8.3, G, I.2, K, N.1, N.2, R			used as the bullet symbol.		
**		B, C, D, E, H, Q, T		Ed	ISO/IEC documents do not retain annexes that are no longer used in the current edition, whether labelled normative or informative.	Delete all unnecessary legacy annexes and any cross-references to them.  Re-number remaining annexes and update all cross-references throughout document text.	Not accepted, Annexes still in use are widely referenced using their current naming and cannot be moved. The more common example is Annex S (Procedure for the unification and arrangements of CJK Ideographs)
**		M		Ed	ISO/IEC documents do not contain a list of source documents in annexes.	Delete Annex M and all cross-references throughout the document text.  Add a bibliography at the end of the document if it is helpful to the document user to have the details of informative reference documents.	Accepted in principle,  This annex presents information very important to the comprehension of the standard and provides fundamental evidence to the encoded characters.  At the same time it is fully included in the References section of the Unicode Standard, therefore a link to that section will be replacing the annex.

<sup>1</sup> **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

<sup>2</sup> **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: June 17, 2020 Document: DIS 10646 Comments Project: 10646.00.00.00.06

MB/NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/Figure/Table/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
**		ALL		Ed	ISO/IEC documents self-refer with the wording 'this document', rather than 'this International Standard', 'this standard', 'ISO/IEC 10646' or any alternative.	Change all self-references in the document text to 'this document'.	Not accepted  While a large majority of self-references in 10646 use the 'this document' terminology, there are a limited number of cases where that convention would make the text unreadable. This is especially true in text describing the standard referencing such as Annex N.
**		1		Ed	The final 2 paragraphs of the Scope are better suited to the Introduction, where additional information is located. The Scope shall only specify the content and applicability of this document.	Move final 2 paragraphs of Scope to Introduction.	Accepted
**		2		Ed	Reference documents should only be dated if a specific element within them (figure, table, annex, etc.) is cited. Otherwise they should be left undated.	Remove dates from ISO/IEC 2022 and ISO/IEC 6429 (and remove the date from references to 6429 inside the text also).	Accepted, although not sure what it is gained by doing this.
**		3.21		Ed	A definition should be self-contained, with any reference to other parts of the document text (or other documents) contained in a note to entry.	Move the text in brackets in the definition into a note to entry.	Accepted
**		3.36, 3.37		Ed	ISO/IEC publications (withdrawn or otherwise) should be not be presented as terms and definitions. The background information about former editions or withdrawn documents can be given informatively if it is helpful for the user to have this detail.	Delete 3.36 and 3.37 and move any background series information to an informative part of the document text such as a NOTE or the Introduction. For the first instance that a withdrawn document is mentioned, add a footnote to explain that it is withdrawn.  Any reference throughout the document to ISO/IEC 10646-1 or ISO/IEC 10646-2 shall be amended to the document number only, not 'Part 1 of...', or any such alternative.	Not accepted  These former publications are normatively referenced in part of the standard (such as Annex A)

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial



## Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: June 17, 2020 Document: DIS 10646 Comments Project: 10646.00.00.00.06

MB/ NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
**		4.3	a)	Ed	List item a) incorrectly refers to items b) and c) as 'sub-clauses'.	Change to 'items'.	Accepted
**		3.9		Ed	Definition is not formed using different words to the term, it is circular and adds no clarity for the document user.	Delete – unnecessary.	Accepted
**		ALL	NOTEs	Ed	NOTEs cannot contain the verbal forms specified to convey requirements, recommendations or permissions (shall, should, may).	Review all NOTEs – there are instances of these verbal forms which mean that the NOTE needs to be reworded as an informative statement of fact or changed to body text.	Accepted, see comment JP2, JP3, JP4, JP5, JP6
**		ALL		Ed	Cross references to other clauses are written as 'Clause X', not just the number, whereas for subclauses (x.x onwards) only the number is required.	There are instances of cross-references where the word Clause is missing (e.g. in 7.4). Review and insert any missing words.	Accepted
**		8	Paragraph 1	Ed	ISO/IEC publications do not contain information about the work of ISO/IEC subcommittees. This is for internal committee reference only.	Delete paragraph 1.	Accepted
**		ALL		Ed	Editor's notes shall not be contained in the FDIS/PDF submission.	Delete all editor's notes, e.g. in 34.3.	Accepted, The notes themselves were clearly mentioning they would be removed before publication.
**		34.5		Ed	ISO/IEC documents do not contain intentionally blank pages in the main body of the document.	Re-flow preceding pages of text, if required, to insert judicious page breaks so that no pages are left blank.	Accepted in principle, code charts are produced separately, therefore the reflow may not be possible between the end of code charts and the start of Annex A.
**		P, U		Ed	Each annex shall be cross-referenced in the text so that its purpose and status as normative or informative can be given to the document user.	Insert cross-references to annexes P and U in the document text as appropriate.	Accepted In line with this, a reference to Annex S will be added to clause 29.

<sup>1</sup> **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

<sup>2</sup> **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial