

IRG Meeting #48 Editorial Report on IRG PnP and Other Miscellaneous Items

PART A: IRG PnP

Discussion on IRG N218 3:

1. The IRG agrees not to register its own IVD collection. Member bodies should consider submitting an IVD collection directly to Unicode for registration. This is because IVD collections are generally specific to a particular region or locale. However, the IRG is willing to help member bodies to review IVD submissions, if needed, especially when questionable cases are presented to the IRG for discussion.
2. IRG also recognizes that the main purpose of CJK Compatibility Ideographs in ISO/IEC 10646 was for round-trip conversion with legacy character set standards. Most of IRG's work, currently and in the future, is for the encoding of ancient or rarely-used characters, and IRG therefore agrees in principle not to propose CJK Compatibility Ideographs in the future, and instead to encourage member bodies to register IVSes to a new or an existing IVD collection.
3. IRG agrees to add a section in its PnP that references the IVD and for reviewing IVD submissions as one of the suggested solutions for handling unifiable characters in future working sets. The IRG would appreciate if Unicode were to waive the registration fee for IVD submissions from IRG member bodies.
4. IRG agrees in principle to the editorial changes related to the above principle changes stated in Items 4 through 7 of IRG N2183.

Discussion on IRG N2206:

The IRG considers the proposed informative information to be locale-dependent. Different experts, especially experts from different regions, may have a different understanding about the same group of characters. The IRG therefore does not consider it appropriate to maintain such a list. The IRG encourages Henry Chan (author of IRG N2206) to propose to the UTC appropriate properties or property values for the Unihan Database.

Discussion on IRG N2211 and IRG N2216:

Some changes to the unification rules were proposed by IRG N2211 and IRG N2216. Both documents proposed to apply new rules to IRG Working Set 2015. But, the majority of IRG experts prefer to apply the new rules starting from the next IRG Working Set. Also, some proposals are found to be already covered by the current PnP. IRG agrees to the additional rules being applied to IRG Working Set 2015 and all future ones.

5. In reference to B1 of IRG N2211 and IRG N2216, much of the evidence used for character encoding comes from pre-Kai-style documents or engravings. The IRG generally agrees that any submission using pre-Kai-style evidence needs to supply a transcription normalization document similar to what ROK has done for IRG Working Set 2015 (IRG N2154).
6. Characters from ancient documents that are rare and not in general circulation should have their base characters identified, then submitted as IVSes to be registered in a new or an existing IVD collection.
7. Variants from tombstone carvings that are not in circulation nor used in printed form should also use authoritative dictionaries and references to determine appropriate base characters to be used for an IVD submissions.
8. With regard to derived simplified characters, IRG reiterates that derived simplified characters (in part or in all) will not be accepted unless actual use can be proven. IRG also reiterates that derived simplified characters from a dictionary as a source should not be used as the sole evidence of actual use unless the dictionary is from an IRG-accepted authoritative dictionary.
9. Because there may still be future versions of Han Yu Da Zi Dian, the IRG reiterates that the acceptance of Han Yu Da Zi Dian as an authoritative dictionary in the IRG PnP applies only to the published editions (1 and 2). This therefore does not imply that future editions of Han Yu Da Zi Dian will be automatically accepted as a valid source for character use.

Discussion related to IRG N2182 and IRG Working Set 2015 review work:

The IRG agrees that, in its editorial work of IRG Working Sets, the IDS and the total stroke count should be included in the IRG Working Set review charts. Also, when submitters disagree with a suggested unification, it is insufficient to simply point out that there is no UCV example. The IRG reiterates that the UCV list and the other documents in its IWDS are working documents subject to ongoing update as the result of IRG Working Set reviews. In other words, “No case in UCV list” is no longer a sufficient reason for dis-unification. The IRG requests submitters to also provide unification and dis-unification examples, from published versions of the standard as well as those accepted for publication, as additional information to help the IRG to determine whether they should be dis-unified or unified (which may result in additional UCVs or other related documents).

Discussion related to IRG WDS update:

With reference to IRG N2154, Version 1.1 of ROK’s Normalization document, the IRG agrees to add a new type of working document to its series to record the normalization guidelines in submitted internal work. Normalization guidelines will be organized by member body and script transcription type.

The above PnP changes should not take effect until after PnP Version 10 is confirmed in principle by IRG and WG2. Also, the revised rules will not be applicable to IRG Working Set 2015 review unless otherwise stated explicitly in this document.




IRG instructs its Rapporteur to revise the text of IRG PnP 9.0 as a draft for IRG PnP 10.0 (IRG N2222) based on the above revisions, and supply the revised text according to the following schedule.

- 2017-06-22 (2017-06-30): Draft 1 by Rapporteur is ready for circulation: First round
- 2017-07-07 (2017-07-14): Editors to supply feedback on editorial changes.
- 2017-07-21 (2017-07-29): Rapporteur to produce Draft 2.
- 2017-08-07 (2017-08-14): Editors to supply feedback on editorial changes.
- 2017-08-14 (2017-08-21): Draft 3 as the final version for submission to WG2 #66 for feedback.

Part B: Reduction of Ideograph Variants per WG2 Request

With regard to WG2’s suggestion in its #64 meeting, the IRG has reviewed its own review work. In addition to the unifiable cases that could be handled via the IVD, the IRG would also like to request that the UTC consider extending UTS #37, which is currently used to handle only unifiable cases, to handle the following two additional types of cases:

- Characters with the same structure, with variant components in the 2nd level (or more), which may not be generally unifiable, but for which the IRG can provide strong evidence linking them to encoded characters as variants: Examples of such cases are shown below:

00002	 UTC-01671	U+4E32		D
00083	 UTC-01506	U+8FF A		
03444	 UTC-01164	U+818 D		D
05541	 UTC-02614		2B733  龟 213'5 GGH-1030.09	D

- b. Character that have a different structure, but whose difference is not considered significant enough to encode them as completely independent ideographs, and for which the IRG can provide strong evidence linking them to encoded characters as variants: Examples of such cases are shown below:

	𠄎 T13-2C6A	U+23D9A(𠄎)	23D9A 水 85.8	𠄎 𠄎 𠄎 UCS2003 GKX-0633.13 T6-4A59		D	
02003	游 T13-2C65	U+6E38		游		D	
02274	𠄎 T13-2D53	U+243B7(B)		𠄎		D	
02038	𠄎 T13-2C79	U+6E29(𠄎)	6E29 水 85.9	𠄎 𠄎 𠄎 𠄎 𠄎 G0-4E42 H-8DE0 T3-3C6B J0-3239	𠄎 V1-5C73	#(di)	D
02039	𠄎 T13-2C7A	U+6EAB(B(𠄎))	6EAB 水 85.10	𠄎 𠄎 𠄎 𠄎 𠄎 GE-3067 HB1-B7C5 T1-646B J3-767C K0-682E	𠄎 V1-5C73	#(d)	D

- 2017-09-30: In case the above IRG suggestions are approved at WG2 #66, the related items in PnP 10.0 Draft 3 will be updated to produce Draft 4 for finalizing during IRG #49.

PART C: UNC Proposals

The IRG agrees to accept the UNC proposal from China (IRG N2198) to encode ideographs for three chemical elements. The IRG instructs its Rapporteur to forward IRG N2198 to WG2 for consideration.

The IRG reviewed the UNC proposal from Japan (IRGN2214). The IRG agrees to accept JMJ-057449 and JMJ-060040 as urgently needed characters. The IRG points out that JMJ-057586 should be unified with U+6556. As for JMJ-013582, an evidence shows it can be considered as a variant of U+67A9. The IRG recommends Japan to unify it with U+67A9. Japan is requested to revise its proposal for submission to WG2 #66.

The IRG agrees to accept the UNC proposal from TCA (IRG N2224) to encode ideographs for two chemical elements that overlap with China's UNC proposal (IRG N2198). TCA is requested to confirm the source reference information for the two characters and submit a revised proposal for IRG's record and for submission to WG2 #66.