WG2 N5262

Title: Comment on WG2 N5259

Source: Shuichi TASHIRO, Japan

Reference: WG2 N 5259, IVD 2017-12-12, UCVs

Date: 2024-5-8

According to WG2 N 5255 and WG2 N 5259, at IRG Meeting #62, IRG N2676's "Proposal to Disunify U+5CC0" and IRGN2676_KIM_resp1 reached a unanimous consensus as stated in IRG Recommendation M62.07.

IRG N2676 proposes disunifying characters of 巨山田, including JMJ-10468 proposed in CDAM2.4, to other code points, from U+5CC0, and suggests assigning new code point for them.

IRGN2676_KIM_resp1 suggests removing UCV#94 additionally.

However, the unification rules applied to U+5CC0 is designated as UCV#94 and it has been shared within the IRG, and past CJK encodings have been developed based on this rule.

It must be noted that altering the unification rules once applied for the encoding is a disruptive act against the standard. Such actions should not be taken in fulfilling our responsibility of maintaining interoperability.

On the other hand, it is acceptable that there is a perspective to considering 三山田 and 三山由 as different characters according to discussions and evidences presented in IRG N2210R, IRG N2676, and IRGN2676_KIM_resp1.

Thus, the only two theoretically possible ways are:

1. Let the over-unification of U+5CC0 as is for backward compatibility.

In fact, both JMJ-010468 (巨山田) and JMJ-068030 (巨山由) were assigned to U+5CC0 in accordance with the UCV#94, and registered in the Moji_Joho collection of the IVD 2017-12-12:



Based on this, all administrative systems built in accordance with ISO standards in Japan currently use this code for processing resident names and other information.

2a.	Assign new code points, different from U+5CC0, to both $oxtimes$ 山田 and $oxtimes$ 山由 in	1
	order to accommodate the perspective that they are different characters.	

2b. Instead of assigning two new code points to both of them, it may be possible to keep U+2F879 for 三山由 and change its property from the current CJK Compatibility Ideographs to Unified Ideographs.